

## Arrangement Module 7: Basic Persuasive Arrangement—Refutation

This module is designed for use in Lesson 6: Basic Persuasive Essay with Refutation (see chart, Year-at-a-Glance). You should expect to use at least one class period to complete this module.

### Getting Ready

#### To teach this module, you will need to:

##### Be able to

- Show your students how to clearly state an opponent's view.
- Show your students how to refute an opponent's view by showing why the argument is inadequate.

##### Understand

- That our differences of opinion are rooted in something we agree on.
- That we must examine our arguments carefully to see our points clearly and correctly, and whether they are adequate or inadequate.
- That in refuting an argument, order is essential.

##### Know

- That refutation occurs after the writer has already found points of division between two views or arguments.

#### To teach this module, you will need the following materials:

- Examples of essays that include examples of refutations.
- Arrangement Worksheet 6A: Guide to Refutation
- Arrangement Worksheet 6B: Basic Persuasive Arrangement with Refutation
- Arrangement Template 6: Basic Persuasive Arrangement with Refutation

**When they complete this module, your students will:**

**Be able to**

- Clearly state an opponent’s view.
- Refute an opponent’s view by showing why the argument it is inadequate.

**Understand**

- That our differences of opinion are rooted in something we agree on.
- That we must examine our arguments carefully to see our points clearly and correctly, and whether they are adequate or inadequate.
- That in refuting an argument, order is essential.

**Know**

- That refutation occurs after the writer has already found points of division between two views or arguments.

**Presenting the Material**

***Pre-Grammar***

Subject matter	Presentation
<p><b>Goal:</b> Prepare your students for what they’ll learn in this module.</p> <p>Review division.</p> <p>“Division” means where we disagree, the point at which our opinions divide.</p> <p><b>Transition to Grammar</b></p> <p>Look in the newspaper, or in any blog from the internet. You’ll find plenty of arguments there—some substantial, some weak. Try to find clear arguments—showing division and refutation.</p>	<p><i>Have you ever had an argument with somebody? How did it occur? What happened in the end?</i></p> <p><i>What is division? How do we decide where division occurs in our essays or in our arguments?</i></p>

Arrangement Module 7:  
Basic Persuasive Arrangement—Refutation

**Grammar:**

Subject matter	Presentation
<p><b>Goal:</b> Give your student clear types of refutation.</p> <p>Model “refutation,” refuting the argument of your opponent.</p> <p><b>First type:</b> Give an easy argument where the hole in the argument is very clear.</p> <p>Analyze the argument using Arrangement Worksheet A.</p>	<p>Example, ask:</p> <p><i>You tell your sister she needs to clean her side of the bedroom. She has banana peels hanging from the lamp, ants crawling on her pillow, and clothes strewn everywhere! Your family has guests coming. She tells you that she is busy watching Saturday morning cartoons.</i></p> <p><i>Turn to Arrangement Worksheet 6A: Guide to Refutation.</i></p> <p><i>State the counter-thesis of your thesis (that your sister needs to clean her room).</i> She thinks she does not need to clean her room.</p> <p><i>Now, what are some reasons that she should <b>not</b> clean her room?</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• She needs a break.</li> <li>• She cleaned your side of the bedroom last time.</li> <li>• She is tired.</li> </ul> <p><i>Identify one reason that the first reason is not persuasive. Check one.</i></p> <p><i>Identify that the second reason is not persuasive. Check one.</i></p> <p>Example 2:</p> <p><i>One of your best friends has a beautiful</i></p>
<p><b>Second type:</b></p>	

Arrangement Module 7:  
Basic Persuasive Arrangement—Refutation

<p><b>Third type and subsequent types:</b></p> <p>Repeat this process as many times as you judge necessary. Consider role-playing: Find examples from current news, or find examples in history—whether to drop the atomic bomb, whether to prohibit alcohol all over the country, whether to establish the turkey as our national bird—and have students come up with arguments for and against.</p>	<p><i>family farm and would like to keep it that way. Your local government, however, thinks it would be a good idea to build a bowling alley with public funds. The prime space, they say, would be right where the family farm has stood for many years. The government wants to push for “imminent domain” and have the family move elsewhere.</i></p> <p><i>Again, let’s take a look at Arrangement Worksheet 6A.</i></p> <p><i>State the counter-thesis of your friend’s argument.</i></p> <p>The town should build a bowling alley on this land.</p> <p><i>What arguments does the government give?</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• That the town needs a bowling alley.</li><li>• That a bowling alley adds more to the community than this farm does.</li><li>• That we should support large mega-farms rather than small family farms.</li></ul> <p><i>Why are these reasons not persuasive?</i></p>
---	---

Arrangement Module 7:  
Basic Persuasive Arrangement—Refutation

<p>Each time, refer to Arrangement Worksheet 6A: Guide to Refutation.</p> <p>Ask the same questions each time:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What is the counter-thesis of your thesis?</li> <li>• What are the two best reasons for the counter-thesis (i.e., the two best reasons against your thesis)?</li> <li>• What is one reason that the first reason is not persuasive?</li> <li>• What is a reason that the second reason is not persuasive?</li> </ul> <p>Once you determine that your students grasp the process, proceed to the dialectic stage of the lesson.</p> <p>Note that even when a student is wrong (for instance, if a student believes the local government is right to build a bowling alley where a family farm stands), emphasize the process of refutation. Your students need to be able to find a flaws in their opponent’s arguments and then to refute them.</p>	
---	--

***Dialectic:***

Subject matter	Presentation
<p><b>Compare the steps you took each time</b></p>	<p><i>What questions did we ask each time we were faced with an argument?</i></p> <p><i>What are some reasons that an argument might not be persuasive?</i></p>

**Rhetoric A: Explanation**

Subject matter	Presentation
<p><b>Student states the concept</b></p> <p><u>Ask a few students to summarize the concept learned with various questions:</u></p>	<p><i>How does refutation relate to division?</i></p> <p><i>How do we refute an argument? (say why it's not good enough)</i></p> <p><i>Why do we need to follow a process for refuting an argument? (I.e. why can't we just start arguing or denying the other person's argument?) Why do we need to do division first? Why is order important?</i></p> <p><i>Why do we even need to acknowledge the opponent's viewpoint?</i></p>

**Rhetoric B: Practice/ Application**

Subject matter	Presentation
<p>Students complete their practice and current essays by adding refutation to the outlines.</p> <p><b>Practice</b></p> <p>Have the students complete Arrangement Worksheet 6B: Basic Persuasive Arrangement with their practice essays.</p> <p><b>Application</b></p> <p>Have the students complete Arrangement Worksheet 6B: Basic Persuasive Arrangement with their current essays.</p>	<p><i>Now, let's turn to Arrangement Worksheet 6B: Basic Persuasive Arrangement with Refutation.</i></p> <p><i>We will also use Arrangement Worksheet 6B for our current essays.</i></p>

Arrangement Module 7:  
Basic Persuasive Arrangement—Refutation

## Assessment

Make sure your students have added refutation to both their practice and current essays, having followed the steps outlined on Worksheets 6A and 6B, and paying attention to the specific order in this lesson.

Use Arrangement Template 6 as a model.